

REPORT FOR CONSIDERATION AT PLANNING COMMITTEE

Reference No: HGY/2008/2021

Ward: Highgate

Date received: 13/10/2008

Last amended date: 24/11/2008

Drawing number of plans 646-L-1.001, 002, 003; 646-L-2.001A, 002A, 003A, 004A, 005A, 006A, 007A, 008A, 010, 011, 012, 013, 014, 015, 020A, 021A, 022A, 023A, 024A, 025; 646-L-3.001A, 002A, 010; 646-L-4.001A, 002A, 003A, 004A, 005A, 010, 020, 021, 022, 023; 646-L-5.001, 002, 003

Address: Furnival House, 50 Cholmeley Park N6

Proposal: Listed Building Consent for change of use from hostel to residential (C3) and conversion of property into 15 residential units comprising 6 x 3 bed, 7 x 2 bed and 2 x 1 bed flats that will include erection of two storey rear stepped infill extension and replacement top floor structure to create new unit. Excavation of lower ground floor and new basement to accommodate leisure facilities, 11 car parking spaces in basement area and four parking spaces externally, and 15 cycle spaces. Refuse / re-cycling facilities and associated landscaping.

Existing Use: C2

Proposed Use: C3

Applicant: Rozbelle Ltd

Ownership: Private

PLANNING DESIGNATIONS

Tree Preservation Order

Conservation Area

Contaminated Land

Listed Buildings

Road Network: Borough Road

Officer Contact: Valerie Okeiyi

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT PERMISSION subject to Government office for London

SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

The site is open on its north-west elevation where there is open land that we believe is associated with the adjacent Harrington Scheme horticultural building. To the north of the site are a number of large residential properties on the road named Parklands and to the east a terrace of houses / flats. To the south on the opposite side of the road are open land and tennis courts and to the south-west is the single residence of Kempton House and beyond that the large block of flats that is Cholmeley Lodge.

Cholmeley Park is a single carriageway road approximately 7.5m in width that has pavements of varying widths. A mix of building styles set back behind trees and hedges bound the road

Furnival House is an existing large four storey building with a symmetrical Edwardian Baroque façade with a part semi-basement level. The building is institutional in character and visually prominent in its garden setting when viewed from Cholmeley Park. The building is currently used by the University of Westminster as halls of residence and was originally built by the Prudential Insurance Company as female staff accommodation. It stands alone amongst well-stocked landscaped grounds. The building has a 'U' platform above ground floor level, with the open end of the U facing to the rear.

The building is predominantly of red brick construction with faience detailing to strings, quoins, copings and entrance details. Two later addition utilitarian metal staircases are located on the rear of the building that detracts greatly from the general quality of the structure. The entrance hall has good flooring and embellishment to the entrance areas where building dates are noted. A very poor later addition lift has been inserted in the entrance hall approach. Internally the only other features of note are four circular roof lights, the detailing of which will be retained.

The site is within the designated Highgate Conservation Area and also forms part of the Highgate Bowl. The building itself is not listed. The wall that fronts the site has a local listing. There are no TPO trees on the site.

Furnival House was recently listed as a grade two listed building on the 7th of October 2008. The reasons for the designation were as follows;

- Special historic interest as a purpose built hostel for domestic staff of one of the nation's major financial institutions, built at a time when accommodation for emerging groups of women in cities was being defined, and reflecting the attention to staff welfare to which the Prudential Assurance Company was particularly committed,
- Special architectural interest as a handsome institutional building in the Edwardian Baroque style built with quality materials and craftsmanship, making rich use of the patrons motto and crest through architectural detail.
- While the interior has been much institutionalised, the special interest can be clearly identified in some areas, particular the elaborately plastered entrance hall and the remains of the dining hall

- The good-quality brick and stone entrance boundary wall and composite stone balustrades in the grounds reflect an awareness of its sensitive Highgate location. It has also a group value with the Grade II Cholmeley House next door, a moderne apartment block of the 1930s, and an associational group value with the Grade II * Prudential Assurance headquarters at Holborn Bars by Alfred Waterhouse.

PLANNING HISTORY

HGY/1992/1035-GTD-22-12-92-Furnival House [007] Cholmeley Park London - Dismantling and reconstruction of existing gateway arrangement to facilitate widened access road.

HGY/1992/1039-GTD-20-10-92-Furnival House [007] Cholmeley Park London - Alteration to external elevation including amendment to windows and doors.

HGY/1992/1040-GTD-20-10-92-Furnival House [007] Cholmeley Park London - Construction of brick clad water tank enclosures on existing flat roof.

HGY/1992/1076-GTD-20-10-92-Furnival House [007] Cholmeley Park London - Replacement of two open, non - enclosed steel fire escape staircase with two new open, non-enclosed steel fire escape staircase.

HGY/1992/1364-GTD-10-05-93-Furnival House [007] Cholmeley Park London - Formation of a grasscrete road.

HGY/1993/0035-GTD-09-02-93-Furnival House [007] Cholmeley Park London - Details of materials pursuant to conditions 3 & 4 attached to planning permission HGY/45585.

HGY/1994/0789-WDN-25-04-96-Adjacent to Furnival House Cholmeley Park London -Erection of four storey block comprising 6 No. two bedroom flats with basement parking for seven cars and two additional car parking spaces with ancillary amenity space. (AMENDED DRAWINGS SUBMITTED ON 30TH DECEMBER 1994)~

HGY/1994/0976-WDN-12-11-96-Adjacent to Furnival House Cholmeley Park London -Erection of four storey block comprising 8 no. two bedroom flats with present parking for seven cars and two additional car parking spaces with ancillary amenity space. (Duplicate Application).

HGY/1995/0763-WDN-03-01-96-Furnival House [007] Cholmeley Park London - Listed Building Consent for stabilisation works to two walls of enclosed garden.

HGY/1995/1343-GTD-21-05-96-Tennis court site Furnival House Cholmeley Park London -Display of one advertisement at entrance to site.

OLD/1988/0226-GTD-08-12-88-Furnival House [007] Cholmeley Park London - 11/8/88 Erection of extension to existing glass house new changing rooms, workspace and offices.

HGY/2008/1185-GTD-28-07-08-The Harrington Scheme Rear of Furnival House, 50 Cholmeley Park Hornsey London -Erection of temporary single storey portacabin building to provide a classroom and an office.

DETAILS OF PROPOSAL

Listed Building Consent for change of use from hostel to residential (C3) and conversion of property into 15 residential units comprising 6 x 3 bed, 7 x 2 bed and 2 x 1 bed flats that will include erection of two storey rear stepped infill extension and replacement top floor structure to create new unit. Excavation of lower ground floor and new basement to accommodate leisure facilities.

Furnival House was designated as a Grade two listed building on the 7th of October 2008 therefore from the advice of English Heritage further revisions have been made to encompass changes to the location of the new vertical access core, revisions to the entrance hall configuration, the window fenestration and materials to be used on the rear elevation and the construction type and materials to be used for the replacement top floor accommodation.

The revised materials used for the rear elevation are as follows;

The stepped infill will be lead clad with timber framed openings and etched glass and stainless steel balustrading. The scheme will also involve double glazed timber framed dormer windows and a lead clad mansard roof.

CONSULTATION

Ward Councillors
Highgate CAAC
The Highgate Society
Conservation Team
English Heritage
46 Cholmeley Park
1-21 © Parklands, Cholmeley Park
12a Parklands, Cholmeley Parklands
Flat 1-6 © Kempton House, Cholmeley Park
55a Cholmeley Park
Flat 1-9 © 55 Cholmeley Park
Flat 1-8 © Elm Court, Cholmeley Park
53 Cholmeley Park
51 Cholmeley Park
8-14 (e) Winchester Place
1-6 © Dukes Head Yard

RESPONSES

English Heritage Advice

We have considered the application and are minded to direct as to the granting of listed building consent.

We have therefore drafted the necessary letter of direction as to the granting of consent (draft attached) and referred the case to the Government Office for London. Subject to the Secretary of State not directing reference of the application to him, the Government Office for London will return the letter of direction to you. We would like to draw your attention to the proposed conditions and informatives to which the grant of listed building consent should be made.

If your authority is minded to grant listed building consent, you will then be able to issue a formal decision. Please send us a copy of your Council's decision notice in due course.

Please note that this response relates to listed building matters only. If there are any archaeological implications to the proposals it is recommended that you contact the Greater London Archaeological Advisory Service for further advice (Tel: 020 7973 3735).

Letters from residents

A signed petition has been received from 18 residents of Cholmeley Park and Parklands and 4 further objection letters received. These residents objected to the previous planning application Ref:HGY/2008/1432. These objections still apply but with even more concern as Furnival House is now listed. There concerns are as follows;

- A method statement should have been submitted with the listed building consent because of the large excavation proposed.
- The scheme has not changed in terms of the design and bulk and the developers have not attempted to change anything to meet the requirements of a Grade 2 listed building
- The subterranean, skyline and infill developments constitute overdevelopment
- There will be loss of privacy and light to adjacent homes
- The increase volume in traffic both during and following development would cause unacceptable and dangerous levels of congestion to both residents and local schools

RELEVANT PLANNING POLICY

National Policies

Planning Policy Statement 1 Delivering Sustainable Development
Planning Policy Statement 3 Housing
Planning Policy 15 Planning and the Historic Environment

London Plan

Policy 4b.1 Design principle for a Compact City
Policy 4b.12 Heritage Conservation

Haringey Unitary Development Plan 2006

CSV2 Listed Building
CSV4 Alterations and Extensions to Listed Buildings

Supplementary Planning Guidance 2006

SPG2 Conservation and Archaeology
SPG8b Materials

ANALYSIS/ASSESSMENT OF THE APPLICATION

At the meeting on 25th September 2008 after having had the application presented by council officers The Committee heard representations from objectors on the applicant. The Planning Committee resolved to grant planning permission subject to conditions and a Section 106 agreement being signed by the respective parties for the conversion and extension of the existing property into 15 flats.

On 7th October 2008 Furnival House was Listed as a Grade Two Listed building. The result of the Listing is that a separate application for Listed Building Consent needed to be submitted to enable the proposed development to go ahead. The applicants have therefore submitted this Listed Building Consent application and entered into discussion with officers from English Heritage. As a result of the discussions the scheme remained substantially the same but with the changes described in this report.

The proposed revisions include changes to the location of the new vertical access core, revisions to the entrance hall configuration, the window fenestration and materials to be used on the rear elevation and the construction type and materials to be used for the replacement top floor accommodation.

The revised materials used for the rear elevation are as follows;

The stepped infill will be lead clad with timber framed openings and etched glass and stainless steel balustrading. The scheme will also involve double glazed timber framed dormer windows and a lead clad mansard roof.

English Heritage have considered the application after these further revisions and are minded to direct as to the granting of listed building consent subject to the proposed conditions and informatives they have submitted.

The proposal would therefore not be detrimental to the architectural and historical integrity and detailing of the listed building's interior and exterior.

Comments on objections received from residents

- The method statement has been dealt with in condition 8 of the full planning permission.
- In order to meet the requirements of a grade II listed building, further revisions have been made after meetings with English Heritage and the architects.
- With regards to the loss of privacy, amenity and increase volume of traffic both during and following development. These issues were dealt with as part of the previous discussions at committee which led to the committee resolving to grant planning permission.

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

To conclude after further revisions listed building consent for change of use from hostel to residential (C3) and conversion of property into 15 residential units comprising 6 x 3 bed, 7 x 2 bed and 2 x 1 bed flats that will include erection of two storey rear stepped infill extension and replacement top floor structure to create new unit. Excavation of lower ground floor and new basement to accommodate leisure facilities is now considered acceptable for the following reason; the proposal would not be detrimental to the architectural and historical integrity and detailing of the listed building's interior and exterior. As such it would be in accordance with policies CSV2 Listed Building and CSV4 Alterations and Extensions to Listed Buildings of the Haringey Unitary Development Plan and the Councils SPG2 Conservation and Archaeology and SPG8b Materials. It is therefore appropriate to recommend that listed building consent be APPROVED.

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT PERMISSION

Registered No. HGY/2008/2021

Applicant's drawing No.(s) 646-L-1.001, 002, 003; 646-L-2.001A, 002A, 003A, 004A, 005A, 006A, 007A, 008A, 010, 011, 012, 013, 014, 015, 020A, 021A, 022A, 023A, 024A, 025; 646-L-3.001A, 002A, 010; 646-L-4.001A, 002A, 003A, 004A, 005A, 010, 020, 021, 022, 023; 646-L-5.001, 002, 003

Subject to Government office for London

1. All new external and internal works and finishes and works of making good to the retained fabric, shall match the existing adjacent work with regard to the methods used and to material, colour, texture and profile, unless shown otherwise on the drawings or other documentation hereby approved or required by any condition(s) attached to this consent.

Reason: In order to safeguard the special architectural or historic interest of the building.

2. Details in respect of the following shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Council as local planning authority in consultation with English Heritage before the relevant work is begun. The relevant work shall be carried out in accordance with such approved details:

a. Drawings (elevations and plans) at 1:20 of: entrance hall, existing and new staircore.

b. Sections of new cornices, architraves, mouldings at (1:5).

c. Sections showing relationship of new partitions to ground floor decorative ceilings, and reflected ceiling plan showing relocated roof lights.

d. A full engineer's report and method statement detailing underpinning and excavation works.

Reason: In order to safeguard the special architectural or historic interest of the building.

INFORMATIVE: The works hereby approved are only those specifically indicated on the drawing(s) and/or other documentation referred to above.

INFORMATIVE: No new plumbing, pipes, soilstacks, flues, vents or ductwork shall be fixed on the external faces of the building unless shown on the drawings hereby approved.

INFORMATIVE: No new grilles, security alarms, lighting, cameras or other appurtenances shall be fixed on the external faces of the building unless shown on the drawings hereby approved.

REASONS FOR APPROVAL

After further revisions listed building consent for change of use from hostel to residential (C3) and conversion of property into 15 residential units comprising 6 x 3 bed, 7 x 2 bed and 2 x 1 bed flats that will include erection of two storey rear stepped infill extension and replacement top floor structure to create new unit. Excavation of lower ground floor and new basement to accommodate leisure facilities is now considered acceptable subject to conditions and informatives. As such it would be in accordance with Policies CSV2 'Listed Building' and CSV4 'Alterations and Extensions to Listed Buildings' of the Haringey Unitary Development Plan and the Councils SPG2 'Conservation and Archaeology' and SPG8b 'Materials'. It is therefore appropriate to recommend that Listed Building Consent be approved.